

**To:** Wenz, Tom[Wenz.Tom@epa.gov]; Essenthier, Leo[Essenthier.Leo@epa.gov]; Essoka, Jonathan[ESSOKA.JONATHAN@EPA.GOV]  
**Cc:** Trevena, Suzanne[Trevena.suzanne@epa.gov]; Carkhuff, Ann[Carkhuff.Ann@epa.gov]  
**From:** Sincock, Jennifer  
**Sent:** Wed 9/14/2016 5:38:54 PM  
**Subject:** FW: Regarding James River chlorophyll a criteria -- FW: FOIA Request  
**MAIL\_RECEIVED:** Wed 9/14/2016 5:38:59 PM  
[EPA Ches Bay Office FOIA Request \(8-29-16\).pdf](#)  
[Fwd: From Programmatic Goals to Criteria for Phytoplankton Chlorophyll a](#)

Hi Tom,

I think you will want to loop Leo Essenthier from WPD into this FOIA request. He is the 106 grant lead for ICPRB. You may also need to loop in Jonathan Essoka who is the VA 106 lead. I think the James River work was funded in part by ICPRB's 106 grant but perhaps the VA 106 grant was also used. I'm cc'ing Leo and Jonathan so they can see these messages. It is likely that the FOIA request to VA supplied many of the same emails EPA would have. However, we will still need to provide EPA's emails as part of the EPA FOIA request. Thanks, Jen

**Jennifer Sincock**

**Office of Standards, Assessment, and TMDLs**

**Water Protection Division**

**U.S. EPA Region III**

**1650 Arch Street (3WP30)**

**Philadelphia, PA 19103**

**(215) 814-5766**

Check out the Chesapeake Bay TMDL website at: <http://www2.epa.gov/chesapeake-bay-tmdl>

**From:** Wenz, Tom  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 14, 2016 10:25 AM  
**To:** Sincock, Jennifer <Sincock.Jennifer@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** FW: Regarding James River chlorophyll a criteria -- FW: FOIA Request

Jen,

This is all Greek to me. It does seem some 106 grant funds were used, which would not be from CBPO. Not sure how or what to do with this with regards to the FOIA.

Tom

**From:** Winters, Julie  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 14, 2016 10:14 AM  
**To:** Wenz, Tom <[Wenz.Tom@epa.gov](mailto:Wenz.Tom@epa.gov)>; Batiuk, Rich <[Batiuk.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Batiuk.Richard@epa.gov)>; Waldman, Holly <[waldman.holly@epa.gov](mailto:waldman.holly@epa.gov)>; Mackey, Lori <[mackey.lori@epa.gov](mailto:mackey.lori@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Hindin, Rebecca <[Hindin.Rebecca@epa.gov](mailto:Hindin.Rebecca@epa.gov)>; Winters, Julie <[Winters.Julie@epa.gov](mailto:Winters.Julie@epa.gov)>; Bisland, Carin <[bisland.carin@epa.gov](mailto:bisland.carin@epa.gov)>; Edward, James <[edward.james@epa.gov](mailto:edward.james@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** FW: Regarding James River chlorophyll a criteria -- FW: FOIA Request

Regarding the FOIA and the VA CBIG and CBRAP grants, please see forwarded from VA.

**JULIE WINTERS** ~ Chesapeake Bay Program Office ~ U.S. Environmental Protection Agency ~  
410.267.5754

**From:** Kennedy, John (DEQ) [<mailto:John.Kennedy@deg.virginia.gov>]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 14, 2016 10:10 AM  
**To:** Winters, Julie <[Winters.Julie@epa.gov](mailto:Winters.Julie@epa.gov)>; Batiuk, Rich <[Batiuk.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Batiuk.Richard@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Schneider, Jutta (DEQ) <[Jutta.Schneider@deg.virginia.gov](mailto:Jutta.Schneider@deg.virginia.gov)>; Davis-Martin, James (DEQ) <[James.Davis-Martin@deg.virginia.gov](mailto:James.Davis-Martin@deg.virginia.gov)>; Periverzov, Eileen (DEQ) <[Eileen.Periverzov@deg.virginia.gov](mailto:Eileen.Periverzov@deg.virginia.gov)>; Adams, Diana (DEQ) <[Diana.Adams@deg.virginia.gov](mailto:Diana.Adams@deg.virginia.gov)>  
**Subject:** FW: Regarding James River chlorophyll a criteria -- FW: FOIA Request

Julie – DEQ got the same FOIA request and on 9/6/16 we provided all available electronic records (email, contract documents, interim and final work products) that related to Dr. Buchanan and her participation on the James River Science Advisory Panel, as well as the package of materials/other documentation from the SAP’s “Empirical Relationships Report” (same documentation given to Rich Batiuk for the CBP-STAC review) on 2 CDs. I also met with

Patrick Fanning prior to our response to go over the materials available and hone in on what exactly he was looking for because the FOIA request was very broad. We felt that our response satisfied the request for "State information" and were relying on EPA to provide the "Federal information" sought.

During the course of the **James River** study we did subcontract, using state funds, with ICPRB for some data analysis via our prime contract with Chesapeake Environmental Communications; the report was entitled "*Balanced, Indigenous, Desirable Phytoplankton Populations in Virginia Tidal Waters*" (Buchanan; 3/10/15). That contract document and scope of work was in the electronic documentation for the FOIA provided on a CD.

Our **James River** Study was solely funded from the Virginia Water Quality Improvement Fund; no federal funds have been passed through by DEQ to any of our contractors. We are aware of at least one related report where Dr. Buchanan cites EPA funding (CWA Section 106 grant) in the acknowledgements ("*From Programmatic Goals to Criteria*"; 2/26/16). Attached is the transmittal email from Dr. Buchanan when she provided a copy to DEQ; the email string includes her transmittal of the report the same day to Leo Essenthier/EPA. Whether or not any other ICPRB contracts/projects related to the **James River** study were funded by EPA is a question for EPA to answer.

I hope this information is useful.

Thanks,

John Kennedy  
DEQ-Office of Ecology

Email: [john.kennedy@deq.virginia.gov](mailto:john.kennedy@deq.virginia.gov)  
Phone: 804-698-4312

**From:** Winters, Julie [<mailto:Winters.Julie@epa.gov>]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 13, 2016 12:09 PM  
**To:** Periverzov, Eileen (DEQ); Davis-Martin, James (DEQ); Hale, Susan (DCR)  
**Cc:** Winters, Julie; Waldman, Holly; Mackey, Lori; Wenz, Tom; Batiuk, Rich; Bisland, Carin  
**Subject:** Regarding **James River chlorophyll** a criteria -- FW: FOIA Request

Eileen,

Please see the attached Freedom of Information Request looking for information regarding the **James River Chlorophyll** a Study. Please let me know whether or not any VA DEQ funded ICPRB for anything related to the development of this study under any of the CBIG or CBRAP grants? For now, please tell us whether you have anything or not. If you do, can you please tell us which grant and objective it was for now?

Thanks so much,

Julie

**JULIE WINTERS** ~ *Chesapeake Bay Program Office ~ U.S. Environmental Protection Agency ~*  
*410.267.5754*

**From:** Wenz, Tom  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 07, 2016 12:04 PM  
**To:** Mackey, Lori <[mackey.lori@epa.gov](mailto:mackey.lori@epa.gov)>; Winters, Julie <[Winters.Julie@epa.gov](mailto:Winters.Julie@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Edward, James <[edward.james@epa.gov](mailto:edward.james@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Fw: FOIA Request

FYI, Rich got this FOIA request and I've passed it on to Philly to assign either to us as lead with WPD support or vice versa.

Need to know if the Interstate Commission on the Potomac River Basin (ICPRB) only gets funds through the 106 grants or if there are CBRAP or CBIG moneys sent to them as well?

Tom

---

**From:** Batiuk, Rich  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 7, 2016 7:16 AM  
**To:** Wenz, Tom  
**Subject:** FW: FOIA Request

Tom-

I have received both an electronic and a hard copy of this FOIA request. I will forward you my electronic acknowledgement of the receipt of the electronic and hard copy of the FOIA request.

Can you please work with the appropriate colleagues in Philadelphia to log in this FOIA request. I have provided you with the original hard copy request as well for our FOIA files.

I will search my files for any and all correspondence related to the this topic—Claire Buchanan, ICPRB, development of a document reviewing the James River chlorophyll a criteria which was funded, I believe, through a Region 3 106 grant to ICPRB. My correspondence on this topic is very limited as I was not aware of the development of this subject document until the work had been completed. Once I get a response back from Jenn, I would like to meet with you to walk through the FOIA request and carefully outline the full scope of the search.

Jenn-

Can you please point Tom and I towards the colleague or colleagues in the Water Protection Division which may have had any involvement in the subject of this FOIA. I believe ICPRB was funded to carry out this work through their 106 grant.

Nick/Jim/Carin/Lori-

Heads up on another FOIA.

Thanks, Rich

Rich Batiuk

Associate Director for Science, Analysis and Implementation

Chesapeake Bay Program Office

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

410 Severn Avenue

Annapolis, Maryland 21403

410-267-5731 Work

443-223-7823 Mobile

[batiuk.richard@epa.gov](mailto:batiuk.richard@epa.gov)

[www.chesapeakebay.net](http://www.chesapeakebay.net)

**From:** Fanning, Patrick Joseph [<mailto:Patrick.Fanning@troutmansanders.com>]

**Sent:** Monday, August 29, 2016 2:33 PM

**To:** Batiuk, Rich <[Batiuk.Richard@epa.gov](mailto:Batiuk.Richard@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** FOIA Request

Hi Mr. Batiuk:

Attached please find a Freedom of Information Act request. Thank you for your attention to this request and please contact me with any questions.

Thanks,

Patrick

Patrick J. Fanning

**Troutman Sanders LLP**

1001 Haxall Point

P.O. Box 1122 (23218)

Richmond, VA 23219

**Direct** [804-697-1363](tel:804-697-1363)

[patrick.fanning@troutmansanders.com](mailto:patrick.fanning@troutmansanders.com)

---

This e-mail communication (including any attachments) may contain legally privileged and confidential information intended solely for the use of the intended recipient. If you are not the intended recipient, you should immediately stop reading this message and delete it from your system. Any unauthorized reading, distribution, copying or other use of this communication (or its attachments) is strictly prohibited.